

appendix 3

Outcomes of Consultation: Submissions
from the Public

Contents

Introduction to Appendix 3	1
Quotations, abbreviations and macrons	1
1. Scoping Meetings: summary of outcomes	3
Introduction	4
Issues and ideas expressed	4
Outcomes of the scoping process	8
2. Public Meetings: summary of outcomes	10
Human health issues	12
Consumer choice/Labelling issues	13
Cultural and spiritual issues	14
Environmental issues	15
Economic issues	16
Future use issues	17
Global development issues	18
Ethical issues	19
Other issues commonly addressed at workshops	20
Legislation	20
Animal rights	21
3. Analysis of Public Submissions	22
3.1 Introduction to the analysis of Public Submissions	23
The submission process	25
Analysis of Public Submissions	25
Profile of Public Submissions	27
The report structure	28
3.2 Strategic outcomes, issues and options	30
Background	30
Outline of this section	30
Strategic outcomes	31
Health outcomes	31

	Environment outcomes	32
	Social outcomes	32
	Economic outcomes	33
	Strategic issues	34
	Issues of choice	34
	Issues of risk and risk management	35
	Issues of acceptability	37
	Strategic options for genetic modification	38
	Health-related options	39
	Environment-related options	41
	Social-related options	41
	Economy-related options	42
3.3	Statutory and regulatory system	44
	Background	44
	Outline of this section	45
	Adequacy of current statutory and regulatory system	45
	Problems with current system	46
	Suggested improvements	48
3.4	Use of genetic modification, genetically modified organisms and products	53
	Background	53
	Outline of this section	53
	How genetic modification technology is being used	55
3.5	Evidence and uncertainty	56
	Background	56
	Outline of this section	56
	General comments	56
	Environmental matters	60
	Social matters	62
	Health matters	62
	Food matters	63
	Economic matters	65
3.6	Risks and benefits	67
	Background	67
	Outline of this section	67
	General overview	67
	Risks and benefits of use of genetic modification	68
	Benefits	68
	Risks	70
	Risks and benefits of avoidance of genetic modification	74
	Benefits	74
	Risks	75
3.7	International obligations	77
	Background	77

Outline of this section	77
Trade and other agreements	77
Sovereignty issues	79
3.8 Liability	80
Background	80
Outline of this section	80
Problems around attribution of liability	80
Producers' liability	82
The State's liability	82
Liability insurance	82
Regulatory framework	83
3.9 Intellectual property	84
Background	84
Outline of this section	84
Definition and characteristics	84
The application of patenting	84
Advantages and disadvantages of patenting	85
The legislative context and its adequacy	85
3.10 Treaty of Waitangi	88
Background	88
Outline of this section	88
Treaty of Waitangi	88
Tikanga principles and genetic modification	89
3.11 Global developments	91
Background	91
Outline of this section	91
Partnership with nature	91
Economic globalisation	92
Biotechnology revolution	92
Consumer responses to genetic modification	92
Legal and policy responses to genetic modification	93
3.12 Opportunities from use or avoidance	94
Background	94
Outline of this section	94
Opportunities from use of genetic modification	94
Opportunities from avoidance of genetic modification	96
3.13 Main areas of public interest	98
Background	98
Outline of this section	98
Distribution of concerns	99
Human health	99
Environmental matters	101
Economic matters	102
Cultural and ethical concerns	103

	Social matters	104
	Risk and uncertainty	105
3.14	Summary of analysis of Public Submissions	106
	Background	106
	Main themes against Warrant items	109
	Strategic outcomes, issues and options	109
	Statutory and regulatory system	110
	Use of genetic modification, genetically modified organisms and products	110
	Evidence and uncertainty	111
	Risks and benefits	111
	International obligations	112
	Liability	112
	Intellectual property	112
	Treaty of Waitangi	113
	Global developments	113
	Opportunities from use or avoidance	113
	Main areas of public interest	114
3.15	Comment on policy, process and regulation provided through public submissions by public sector organisations	116
	Background	116
	Australia New Zealand Food Authority	117
	Department of Conservation	120
	Human Rights Commission	122
	Institute of Environmental Science and Research	124
	Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry	126
	Ministry of Consumer Affairs	129
	Ministry of Economic Development	130
	Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade	133
	Ministry of Health	135
	Te Puni Kokiri	136
4.	Analysis of Maori Consultation programme	140
4.1	Analysis of oral and written submissions from Hui	141
	Background	141
	Outline of Regional Hui	142
	Wanganui Regional Hui	142
	Whangarei Regional Hui	143
	Rotorua Regional Hui	143
	Wellington Regional Hui	144
	Blenheim Regional Hui	146
	Hastings Regional Hui	146

	Gisborne Regional Hui	147
	Christchurch Regional Hui	148
	Dunedin Regional Hui	148
	Auckland Regional Hui	149
	Outline of National Hui	150
	Recommendations on genetic modification from the hui	152
	Analysis of main points in oral and written submissions	153
	Tikanga Maori	153
	Treaty of Waitangi	155
	Control and benefits	156
	Information and Time	157
4.2	Analysis of cultural, spiritual and religious issues for Maori raised in Public Meetings	159
	Background	159
	Methodology	160
	Whose views?	160
	Issues raised	161
	Attitudes and knowledge	161
	Treaty of Waitangi and genetic modification	161
	Tikanga/spiritual	162
	Food and medicine	163
	Intellectual property	164
	Summary	165
4.3	Analysis of views relating to Maori raised by the Youth Forum	166
	Background	166
	Views expressed	166
	Essays	166
	Role-play	167
	Treaty of Waitangi	167
	Conclusion	168
5.	Youth Forum: summary of outcomes	169
	Introduction	170
	Programme	170
	Issues for discussion	171
	Participants' views on the seven priority topics	172
	Medical and human health	172
	Environmental	173
	Economic	174
	Consumers and food	174
	Treaty of Waitangi	175
	Ethics and morals	176
	Political and legal	176
	Conclusion	177

6.	Analysis of Public Opinion Survey	178
	Introduction	179
	Key overall findings	179
	Importance of genetic modification to New Zealand	182
	Demographic profile of the two “importance” groups	186
	Key findings	197
	Awareness and understanding of genetic modification	197
	To what extent is genetic modification already being used in New Zealand?	198
	Are there more advantages or more disadvantages?	207
	Do you approve or disapprove of genetic modification?	211
	What genetic modification has to offer New Zealand	223
	Knowledge and personal importance of genetic modification	224
	Demographic differences	226
7.	Glossaries	235
7.1	Glossary of technical terms	236
7.1	Glossary of Maori terms	250
7.3	Abbreviations	252
	Index	254